Community & Climate Engagement During COVID-19: What to do When in Person isn’t Possible

SEEC Virtual Forum: Webinar #4
June 30, 2020 | 1:00 – 2:00 PM PST
Thank you to...

Our sponsors for making this series possible!

Our promotional partners for extending our reach!
Upcoming Events

Learn more and register at: californiaseec.org/2020-forum/

7/08 – Webinar #5
Extreme Heat Resilience Among Disadvantaged Communities in Stockton

7/16 – Webinar #6
Identifying, Prioritizing, Financing Projects

7/21 – Networking Activity
Energy Trivia
# SEEC Bingo

**Connect, Network, and Win a Sustainability Prize!**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owns an Electric Vehicle</th>
<th>Has Solar Panels on Their Property</th>
<th>Works for or Has Worked for the CEC</th>
<th>Has Drought-Resistant Landscaping</th>
<th>Works in the San Joaquin Valley Region</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Name:</td>
<td>Name:</td>
<td>Name:</td>
<td>Name:</td>
<td>Name:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Is a CCA Customer</th>
<th>Has an EV Charger at Their Home or Apartment Complex</th>
<th>Has at Least One Energy Star® Appliance at Home</th>
<th>Plays a Musical Instrument</th>
<th>Has the Same Job Title That You Have</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Name:</td>
<td>Name:</td>
<td>Name:</td>
<td>Name:</td>
<td>Name:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Household Has Mostly LED Bulbs Installed</th>
<th>Has Cooked Food in a Solar Oven</th>
<th>Is an Elected Official</th>
<th>Worked in the Energy Field in a State Besides California</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Name:</td>
<td>Name:</td>
<td>Name:</td>
<td>Name:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Takes Public Transit to Their Work Office</th>
<th>Lives or Works in a Zero Net Energy (ZNE) Building</th>
<th>Works for a Community Based Organization</th>
<th>Has Run for Office</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Name:</td>
<td>Name:</td>
<td>Name:</td>
<td>Name:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Has Successfully Created Soil from Compost</th>
<th>Has Backyard Chickens</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Name:</td>
<td>Name:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Free**
Q&A
• Submit questions for panelists through the Q&A module at any point during the webinar.
• Upvote questions that you are interested in hearing responses to.

Chat
• Engage in a dialogue with your peers – share resources, case studies, and best practices
• Reach out to LGC staff if you encounter technical issues or have questions about the SEEC Forum.
Welcome!

**Moderator:** Nicole Enright  
Associate Program Manager  
Institute for Local Government

**Dr. Larry Schooler**  
Director of Consensus Building and Community Engagement  
CD&P

**Grace Person**  
Community Design Project Manager  
Local Government Commission

**Angel Hernandez**  
Associate Planner  
City of El Centro

**Hanna Stelmakhovych**  
Program Coordinator  
Institute for Local Government
Exceptional Local Governments, Thriving Communities

Our mission is to help local government leaders navigate complexity, increase capacity and build trust in their communities.
Non-Profit, Non-Partisan & Focused on Helping Local Gov’t

- ILG is the non-profit training and education affiliate of three statewide local government associations
- Together with our affiliates, we serve over 2,500 local agencies – cities, counties and special districts
- We provide practical and easy-to-use resources so local agencies can effectively implement policies on the ground
ILG’s Programs & Services

Program Areas
- Leadership & Governance
- Civics Education & Workforce
- Public Engagement
- Sustainable & Resilient Communities

Services
- Education & Training
- Technical Assistance
- Capacity Building
- Convening

www.ca-ilg.org
COVID-19 Has Changed Public Engagement Forever

Social Distancing

- Community Events
- Public Meetings
- Public Comment
- High Tech Tools
- Digital Engagement
- Low Tech Tools
Who’s In the “Room”?

• Meeting Sift – informal, real time polling

Please Participate

1. open smartphone browser
2. go to sift.ly
3. enter participant code KW6E
LGC Virtual Engagement

Presenter

Grace Person
Community Design Project Manager
Local Government Commission
Best Practices for Virtual Engagement
Key Consideration for effective virtual engagements

- Embrace the Virtual World; Embrace Humanity
- Outcome More Important Than Deliverable
- Purpose of Engagement
- Capacity of Target Audience
- Functionality of Platforms, Programs & Apps
Specific Guidance

how to get most out of virtual outreach and interactions

- Determine Purpose of Event
- ID Target Audience
- Select Type of Event
- Develop Event Content
## Spectrum of Public Participation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Public Participation Goal</th>
<th>Promise to the Public</th>
<th>Example Techniques</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Inform**               | We will keep you informed. | • Factsheets  
• Web sites  
• Open houses | |
| **Consult**              | We will keep you informed, listen to and acknowledge concerns and aspirations, and provide feedback on how public input influenced the decision. | • Public comment  
• Focus groups  
• Surveys  
• Public meetings | |
| **Involve**              | We will work with you to ensure that your concerns and aspirations are directly reflected in the alternatives developed and provide feedback on how public input influenced the decision. | • Workshops  
• Deliberative polling | |
| **Collaborate**          | We will look to you for advice and innovation in formulating solutions and incorporate your advice and recommendations into the decisions to the maximum extent possible. | • Citizen advisory committees  
• Consensus-building  
• Participatory decision-making | |
| **Empower**              | We will implement what you decide. | • Citizen juries  
• Ballots  
• Delegated decision | |

### Event Purpose

To provide the public balanced and objective information to assist them in understanding the problem, alternatives, opportunities and/or solutions.

To obtain public feedback on analysis, alternatives and/or decisions.

To work directly with the public throughout the process to ensure that public concerns and aspirations are consistently understood and considered.

To partner with the public in each aspect of the decision, including the development of alternatives and the identification of the preferred solution.

To place final decision-making in the hands of the public.

*source: International Association for Public Participation, IAP2.org*
**Tips and Tricks**

**Event Planning**
- Start and End Times
- List Time Zone in Notifications
- Provide Information & Resources In Advance

**Delivery Method**
- Webinar-style Presentations
- Breakout Groups for Discussion or Collaboration
Tips and Tricks

Practice Event Logistics
• Test platform, program, or app system
• Run through event agenda
• Designate co-hosts and panelists for early entrance in webinar; assign tech team to support participants’ tech needs

Early Tech-Check and Start-up
• Start event in “practice mode” for early presenter entrance
• Test audio and screen-sharing with presenters and trouble-shoot any issues prior to event start
Facilitating the Event Experience

- Lead by example – model the behavior you want participants to exercise
- Embrace humanity and encourage humor
- Hold space for silence – don’t jump in too soon to fill the gap
- Be mindful and attuned to ALL participant needs
- Regularly check chat, question box, and/or the raise-hand feature
- Provide regular check-ins and updates about agenda schedule and event adjustments

Recommended Flow

- Welcome and Thank You’s
- Introductions and Roles
- Brief Overview of Technical Features and Engagement Options
- Overview of Event Schedule or Agenda
High-Tech and Low-Tech Options

- Language Access and Disabilities Participation
- General Limitations
- Ways to Engage
Highlights

Purpose of Engagement

Intenions vs. Outcomes

Who's the Audience
Social Distancing Meets Public Engagement
Communicating and Listening During COVID-19

Dr. Larry Schooler
Senior Fellow, National Civic League
University of Texas at Austin
“Offline” technology

• Television:
  • Nearly every government agency nationwide (in the U.S. and some elsewhere) has access to a TV station (and most have web streams) that they are underutilizing.

• SMS/Text:
  • 96% of Americans own cell phone of some kind (Pew)
  • 97% of smartphone owners text daily (Pew)
  • Texting is #1 most used way of communication among Americans younger than 50 (Gallup)
  • SMS messages have 98% open rate (vs. 20% for email) (Mobile Marketing Watch)
• Any process that involves the public in problem solving or decision making and uses public input to make decisions.

**DEFINE**

- **FACE-TO-FACE (TRADITIONAL)**
  - Council meetings
  - Boards and Commissions
  - Meetings with constituents

- **FACE-TO-FACE (MODERN)**
  - Public workshops
  - Pop-up stations
  - Task forces/stakeholder groups
  - Volunteer facilitators

- **REMOTE AND VIRTUAL**
  - Local Paper Publications
  - Paper Surveys
  - Televised meetings
  - Voicemail/Telephone Town Hall
  - Online discussion forums
  - Text chats
  - AI/VR
### COMPONENTS

- Phone screener
- Host for public participation
- Client’s IT department/TV staff

### PREPARATION

- Create platform/bridge for elected officials and staff
- Create platform/bridge (including toll-free phone) for public participation
- Create connection between two bridges
- Connect bridge connection to telecast/web stream

### PROCESS

- Connect phone screener to public participation bridge and link via chat to TV host
- Screen calls and provide on-screen labels for callers
- Announce to client new caller
- Unmute call and take on-air

• Continue the regular meetings of government virtually while ensuring transparency, access, and public participation
Commenters by Age

In-Person Participation
- 49%
- 38%
- 9%

Online Participation
- 27.0%
- 23.0%
- 19.0%
- 17.0%
- 14.0%

Colors:
- 25-34
- 35-44
- 45-54
- 55-64
- 65+

Courtesy: Strong Towns/City of Lakewood, CO/People Speak
Offline and On-Air

Televised Town Halls
  i. In-person
  ii. Telephone
  iii. Text
  iv. Multilingual
More of the “town” in “town hall”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Composting and Recycling</th>
<th>Transit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>On Phone</td>
<td>3,944</td>
<td>6,749</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speakers</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Max at once</td>
<td>963</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How To Top The Ratings Charts

• Decisions in the first minute or two
• Engagement
• Call Queue
Real Time feedback

Poll Everywhere, Mentimeter, et al

i. What people really think

ii. Quantitative and qualitative

When I say "public meeting,"

I remember I have a root canal scheduled the same night.

I drink heavily beforehand.

I'm anxious but confident.

I can't wait for it to start.
Anytime

Text, Talk, Act

i. Opt-in

ii. Qualitative and quantitative

iii. Broader population

TRY IT NOW - FREE!

1. Gather a few people

2. Text START to 89800

3. Enjoy an engaging conversation on the importance of staying mentally healthy
What’s one new low-tech practice looking forward to taking on?

Type your response in the chat box.
Hosting a Town Hall Webinar

Angel Hernandez
City of El Centro
El Centro

- Located in Imperial County in SE California
- Population of **43,898**
- **86%** of population identify as Hispanic/Latino
- Households speaking language other than English at home **79%**

Source: (2018 ACS)
El Centro 2040 General Plan Update

- Updating Land Use, Mobility and Environmental Justice Elements of the General Plan
- Downtown Selected as a Focus Area
- Emphasis on policies that encourage entrepreneurship, micro-businesses, & start-ups
- Zoom Webinar
Advertising

- Social media posts
- Email lists
- El Centro 2040 Community Advisory Committee
- Cold calling community members
Preparation

Zoom webinar livestream to Facebook

- Assign backstage roles
- Share script with interpreter
- Test technology
- Dry Runs
Execution

- Instructions slide
- Question slides
- Interpretation/bilingual
  - Side by side translation
  - Interpretation Function
- Facebook
  - Staff forwarded FB questions to Zoom
  - Only one audio channel can be streamed
Execution

- Instructions slides
- Question slides
- Interpretation/bilingual
  - Side by side slides
  - Interpretation
- Function
  - Facebook
    - Staff forwarded FB questions to Zoom
    - Only one audio channel can be streamed
Takeaways

- Great attendance
- Attracting new participants
- Zoom vs. Facebook
- Barriers due to access/comfort with technology
- Professional interpreter
High-Tech Public Engagement

Tools & Tips to Consider

Hanna Stelmakhovych
Program Coordinator
Institute for Local Government
What is “Authentic” Public Engagement

- Inclusive
- Deliberate
- Dialogue
- Culturally Competent

Leaders know where the public stands as problem solving progresses, residents themselves contribute to solutions through their input, ideas and actions.
Hi-tech Digital Engagement Platforms

socialpinpoint

MetroQuest

MindMixer

BANG THE TABLE engagementHQ
How Do We Choose?

What is the **purpose** of your engagement?

What are the **needs** of your project?

**Education**

*Qualitative/qualitative input*

*Transparent dialogue*

*Community-generated ideas*

*Geo-based data/mapping*

*Trade off analysis/prioritization*

*Consensus-based decision-making*
Consider Diverse Groups

- Immigrant communities
- Racial/Ethnic Minorities
- Low-Income Individuals, Transient Population
- Working Families, Renters
- People with Disabilities
- Seniors, Youth
AB 617: Expanding Engagement Opportunities via Social Pinpoint

View Comments

Sort: Recent Popular Info Markers

- **Idling ships**
  - View the discussion
  - 14 days ago

- **Stockpiled commodities are sources of dusts**
  - View the discussion
  - 23 days ago

- **Ingredient Incorporated is the second largest stationary source of PM2.5.**
  - View the discussion
  - 23 days ago
Social Pinpoint
Addressing Digital Engagement Challenges

- Access to internet
- Learning curve
- Language access/translation
- Making online engagement interactive
- Access to necessary technology
Other Tools & Climate Resilience Project Examples

• Climate Ready San Mateo - *Bang The Table*

• San Antonio, Texas Climate Action and Adaptation Plan – *MetroQuest*

• Sustainable DC 2.0 Plan, Engaged Oakland - *MindMixer*
What other high tech public engagement tools/platforms have you used or heard of?
Free Public Engagement Resources Developed for Government

TIERS Training & Framework

TIERS is a step-by-step approach to public engagement at any level.

Interpretation Equipment

Free interpretation equipment can be loaned out and used for simultaneous and consecutive translation with a live translator.

How-Tos and Tip Sheets

Dozens of tip sheets about effective, inclusive and ethical public engagement, describing successful public engagement processes and strategies.

www.ca-ilg.org/inclusive-public-engagement
Stay Connected

Facebook
Like us on Facebook
@InstituteForLocalGovt

Twitter
Follow us on Twitter
@instlocgov

LinkedIn
Connect with us on LinkedIn
Institute for Local Government

Website
Sign up for our e-newsletter
www.ca-ilg.org/stayinformed
Upcoming Events

Learn more and register at: californiaseec.org/2020-forum/

7/08 – Webinar #5
Extreme Heat Resilience Among Disadvantaged Communities in Stockton

7/16 – Webinar #6
Identifying, Prioritizing, Financing Projects

7/21 – Networking Activity
Energy Trivia
Thank you to...

Our sponsors for making this series possible!

Our promotional partners for extending our reach!